

NIMSS AIP NIMSS Multistate Research Project
Aging in Place: Home and Community in Rural America
Responses to Multistate Review Committee

DEADLINE: August 15, 2018

Reviewer: Ahn	
Comment	Action Taken
Goals and objects are appropriate for a multi-state project. This proposed study will get significant benefits in conducting research by utilizing nation-based resources. Research goals and scope are well established and expected outcomes and impacts will provide significant implications for policy making and research.	N/A. Thank you for the positive comments.
Page 2. environmental, social, and financial factors under "objectives 1 and 2" need to be clarified.	Paragraph added after objectives that clarifies environmental, social, and financial factors.
Overall writing needs improvement.	Edited to improve writing.
Reviewer: Gus	
Comment	Action Taken
Aging in place...does it refer to existing homes only or newer homes that are better equipped?	Aging in place may be remaining in the existing home or in another, more appropriate dwelling (not necessarily a newer home), in the community. The proposal has been edited.
Would you approximate total % of seniors in rural areas?	One in five Americans (19.3%) live in a rural area, and the median age is 51, versus 45 in urban areas. The exact percentage of older adults will be part of the data collected.
Differentiate between services approach and home design features.	Added language regarding home modifications on page 1. New paragraph added covers these explanations.
How would you "examine the factors for successful aging in place"?	Additional text has been added to delineate this issue. When the research team convenes, these factors will be delineated.
Reviewer: Lee	
Comment	Action Taken
This proposal would be enhanced by adding clear project justification clarifying why we need to study (relationships among) "rural community," "home	Additional text has been added in the two sections noted (Introduction and The Need).

environment," and "seniors" "in "introduction" and "The Need. As Indicated by Stakeholders.".	
Where there are few relevant studies on rural communities, the authors could focus on rural environment-aging in place and rural environment-policy for older adults.	Some additional text and studies have been added to the review of literature.
This project will use U.S. Census data which I could not see in Project Milestones.	The project milestones reflect two sources of data--secondary data and primary data. These data sources are described in the section on methods. We did not feel that it was necessary to spell out the sources again in the milestones.
For Year 3, the authors "instruments" that will be used. I assume instruments are quantitative methods. Wondering if this project will use only quantitative approach.	The section on methods has been edited to better explain the types of data and types of analyses that will be used. The project incorporates both quantitative and qualitative approaches.
Activities in Logic Model will be included with the objective activities in Project Milestones. For example, I cannot see "conduct workshops to gather primary data" within the Objective related to yearly activities in "Project Milestones."	The proposal has been edited to ensure consistency among the methods, milestones, and logic model.
Reviewer: Unknown (could not read signature)	
Comment	Action Taken
Overall it needs to be more specific.	Edited to be more specific. Suggestions from this reviewer and the others were helpful in making the project more specific.
Not sure if there's a conceptual/theoretical framework.	There is an entire section on theory. The section has been renamed to Theoretical Framework. Text has been added to further strengthen the tie between the Morris and Winter Housing Adjustment Theory and this project.
Not sure how "environmental, social and financial factors" and "successful aging in place" are going to be defined or measured.	As described in objectives 1, 2, 3, this comment addresses the crux of the research. In objective 1, we state that analysis of secondary will identify environmental, social, and financial factors. In objective 2, we state that we will collect data to identify these same factors. In objective 3, we state that will examine and draft policy that promote aging in place. The specific measures will be determined by the research team.
Also suggest to be more specific what's going to be "compared" in different states. e.g., policy implementation or evaluation of any existing policy covering multiple states.	Added text to methods section.

Reviewer: Yelland	
Comment	Action Taken
Your proposed methods of data <i>[analysis]</i> may be inadequate for obtaining a broader understanding of the proposed objectives.	Additional text has been added in the methods section to address this concern.
I would expect a great deal of this information to be disseminated through programmatic opportunities in Extension.	Agreed. Local Extension professionals will be consulted during the project so that they can provide input based on their local needs.
I believe your project could have more impacts than what were identified in the last paragraph.	Agreed, Additional text has been added to note the potential for Extension programs.
I would have liked to see more on how you will incorporate local Extension professionals into building this foundational knowledge--there are likely great opportunities there.	Extension professionals are members of the research team. Additionally, local extension professionals will be involved in workshops as key informants to the project.
Peer Review Comments	
Comment	Action Taken
What is the geography of this research project?	The research team will mainly focus on the states in which they work, given limited resources.
What is the unit of observation of this research project?	The team will examine state level policies and household level secondary data.
How is "rural" defined? How are "older adults" defined?	For the purposes of the American Housing Survey, rural is defined as basically anything that is not urban. Federal government defines urban centers as those of 50,000 or more people.
p. 1: "Older adults tend to suffer from chronic conditions and have more functional limitations and require more goods and services, [...]" What kinds of "more goods" are needed? Don't they need less?	We have replaced this language with the following: Older adults tend to suffer from chronic conditions and have more functional limitations and require a vast array of medical and health-related goods and services, thereby increasing competition for limited resources at the community and individual level.
p. 1: "USDA provides support, for example, in the form of nutrition assistance, rural development, single family [delete: housing investments], multifamily [delete: housing investments], and community investments [...]"	This change has been made.
p. 1: "By conducting this research, we [delete: hope; insert: aim] to identify	These changes have been made.

<p>solutions that [delete: would] minimize [delete: or prolonged] institutionalization and [...].”</p>	
<p>p. 1: “(1) How do we maintain, remodel, or design high-quality sustainable housing for aging in place in rural communities [...].” Who is “we”? How are “rural communities” conceptualized and operationalized? What is the geography of this study? What is the unit of observation of this study? How are “older adults” conceptualized and operationalized?</p>	<p>"We" has been replaced by "households". The other questions have been answered above.</p>
<p>p. 2: “Objective 1: Identify and analyze [...] using secondary data.” How? What data set/s will be analyzed? What method/s will be utilized? What is the geography? What is the unit of observation?</p>	<p>These questions have been answered above.</p>
<p>p. 2: “Objective 2: Identify and analyze [...] using primary data.” How? What data will be collected? The discussion on page ¾ only includes secondary data (albeit vague). What methods will be utilized? What is the geography? What is the unit of observation?</p>	<p>These questions have been answered above.</p>
<p>p. 2: “Objective 2: Identify and analyze [...] using primary data.” How? What data will be collected? The discussion on page ¾ only includes secondary data (albeit vague). What methods will be utilized? What is the geography? What is the unit of observation?</p>	<p>These questions have been answered above.</p>
<p>p. 2: “Objective 3: Examine policies and program [...].” Are these (a) federal, (b) state, (c) regional, (d) county, or local policies? What is the geography? What is the unit of observation? What methods will be utilized? Would these be secondary or primary data?</p>	<p>Federal and state would be too broad a geographic area to incorporate. Assessment of state level policies will be completed by the researchers. During the primary data collection phase, some additional policies, whether they be regional, county, or city, will be learned from the interviews with key informants.</p>
<p>p. 2: “Older adults prefer to age in place.” You may want to avoid global statements.</p>	<p>We have changed the language to soften it, per your suggestion. In the world of gerontology, the term "older adults" has a variety</p>

<p>The AARP survey found that 95 percent prefer to age in place. Thus, you may want to modify this sentence, stating that a very high proportion of older adults prefer to age in place. How are “older adults” conceptualized and operationalized?</p>	<p>of definitions. We operationalize it by focusing on those who are 65 and over.</p>
<p>p. 2: “The ability to remain in one’s own home is dependent upon [insert: the] ability to function later [insert: in] life [...].”</p>	<p>This change has been made.</p>
<p>p. 2: “Aging in place, although preferred, may be problematic in rural areas with limited access to goods and services.” True – yet Amazon ships almost everywhere.</p>	<p>While we see your point, we are referring to place-based types of services that would require more than just shipment from Amazon. We have re-worked this section to be re-stated the following way: "Aging in place, although preferred, may be problematic in rural areas with limited access to goods and services, such as medical facilities, emergency services and wellness centers."</p>
<p>p. 2: “S.M. Golant” -> “Golant”</p>	<p>This change has been made.</p>
<p>p. 3: “The AFCI has the potential [insert: of] providing new and important [...].”</p>	<p>This change has been made.</p>
<p>p. 3: “A sixth housing norm with increasing importance for older adults is affordability. It refers to seniors’ ability to afford housing costs [...].” You may want to include information about the housing cost burden (30 percent) and the severe housing cost burden (50 percent).</p>	<p>This is a good point. We have inserted this language. Once the research team convenes, additional data on affordability, as well as other housing related data, will be identified.</p>
<p>What data sets will be used? “U.S. Census data” is vague as the U.S. Bureau of the Census has hundreds of data sets.</p>	<p>The research team will explore the available datasets and determine which will be the best fit for the project, in addition to the AHS.</p>
<p>p. 3: “The set contains demographic, housing unit [insert a comma] and neighborhood quality indicators [...].” What is the “set”? Reference unclear. Would this be (a) AHS data? (b) AHS and “U.S. Census data”? (c) something else?</p>	<p>We have made the copy-editing changes, and we have clarified that it is the AHS to which we are referring.</p>
<p>p. 4: “State legislative databases will be analyzed [...].” What states are these? What is the geography? You may want to</p>	<p>Edited text to remove reference to database. We will use AHS, as stated, and other data as needed. We will examine state data based on the states in which researchers are working.</p>

state up front how many data sets you will analyze – three? Four? More? And then enumerate them. What methods are utilized?	
p. 4: “The Advantages [...]” Please fix the indent.	Done
p. 5: “The research plan will employ a comparative perspective across rural America.” What is the geography?	Sentences reframed for clarity.
p. 5: “The projects will advance knowledge of households’ willingness and ability to age in place [...]” What are these “projects” (plural)? See the AARP survey which finds that about 95 percent of interviewees prefer to age in place – although there may be reality.	We have modified this statement somewhat in that it now says: "The project will advance knowledge of state responses that allow older adults’ ability to age in place and lay the groundwork for new policies toward accommodating environmental, social and financial factors to age in place in rural areas."
References: · Bascu: two commas after journal title	This has been fixed.
· Golant: volume number and pages in parentheses – no other reference has this	This is the correct way to cite this reference, since it is a book chapter.